

# BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT MARTY MARKOWITZ MITCHELL-LAMA TASK FORCE

#### **AND**

# MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS COALITION PRESENT

## **BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA DAY**

AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAM A RESIDENTS

DATE: TUESDAY, APRIL 19, 2005

TIME: 5:30 P.M. TO 9:00 P.M.

WHERE': BROOKLYN BOROUGH HALL

209 JORALEMON STREET

DOWNTOWN, BROOKLYN v BROOKLYN

MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

FOR:

TO IDENTIFY ISSUES AND CONCERNS

<u>WHY</u>: AFFECTING RESIDENTS OF BROOKLYN MITCHELL-

LAMA RENTAL AND COOPERATIVE DEVELOPMENTS

CONTACT: RSVP (718) 802-3949 NO LATER THAN APRIL 13th

#### LIGHT REFRESHMENTS SERVED

THIS FLYER IS BEING DISTRIBUTED BY RESIDENTS OF

#### **BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA DEVELOPMENTS**



#### **MEMORANDUM**

To: Greg Atkins

From: Frederick C. Arriaga, Eric Fleischman

Date: Monday, April 18, 2005

Subject: "Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day"

Workshop Moderator Briefing

CC: Mary Anne Cino, Jon Benguiat, Judge Ellis Sheila Franke, Tara Martin, Richard Bearak

-----

The following Borough President's staff and other individuals are assigned to Moderator and Assistant Moderator roles in the panel:

- Judge Ellis Sheila Franke (Moderator of panel)
- Jon Benguiat (Assistant Moderator of panel)
- Mary Anne Cino (First Back-up Moderator or Assistant Moderator of panel)
- Jumaanee Williams, Executive Director, Tenants & Neighbors (Second Back-up Moderator or Assistant Moderator of Panel)
- Richard Bearak (Third Back-up Moderator or Assistant Moderator of panel)

The following Borough President's staff is assigned to Moderator roles in workshops:

- Richard Bearak (Workshop A: "Federal, State and City Legislation and Funding: It's Impact on Mitchell-Lama Programs")
- Fred Arriaga (Workshop B: "Mitchell-Lama Development Building Issues: (Coops & Rentals): Quality-of-Life Issues, Maintenance and Security")
- Tara Martin (Workshop C: "Tenant Organizing in Mitchell-Lama Rentals")
- Judge Ellis Sheila Franke (Workshop D: "Mitchell-Lama Coops: By-Laws, Dissemination of Information and Legislative Concerns")
- Jon Benguiat (Workshop E: "The Mitchell-Lama Buyout Process")

The role of moderator of the panel is as follows:

- Refer to the packet of information.
- Introduce each panelist in order by name, title, unit/department, organization/agency.
- Monitor the time of each panelist (no more than 5 minutes per panelist as of the start of the discussion—this number may or may not change after each panelist

- speaks). Total time for the panel is from 6:30 p.m. to 7:45 p.m. (assuming that the panel discussion starts on time).
- At the conclusion of the final panelist, open up the floor to questions and answers submitted by index cards. These cards will be submitted to the Moderator by Borough President's staff and pre-screened.
- Prior to reading the question or comment, please read the name, title development/organization (if given) of the person.
- As best as possible, refer the question to the appropriate panelist or agency/organization or to the entire panel.
- Thank the panelist(s) and person submitting the question (if appropriate).
- At the conclusion of the allotted time for the panel discussion, stop taking additional questions and thank the panelists and attendees.
- If there is a Master or Mistress of Ceremonies, your role is now concluded. If not, please instruct the attendees when and where workshops will be.

#### The role of moderator of a workshop is as follows:

- Be familiar with the panel discussion from earlier in the evening, since it may be referenced during the workshop presentations.
- Make introductions to the workshop speakers and tenant/coop representative(s) prior to the workshop, if possible (Refer to the "Program").
- Ask speakers if they have materials for distribution prior to or during the
  workshop. Ensure that there are a sufficient number of copies of materials for all
  workshop attendees. You may assign either Borough President's staffer
  Mitchell-Lama Task Force members (assisting you) to make additional copies of
  material<sup>^</sup>...
- Provide your business card to the speaker(s) and have enough cards available for attendees if asked.
- Be gracious to the speaker(s) and ask if they would like something to drink and if so, ask one of your assistants to bring it to them.
- Ask the speakers) if they have any time constraints or special needs that you or your assistants can help them with.
- Ask the speaker(s) if they have an outline and/or description of their topic(s) for discussion and provide a copy to you and the other speaker(s).

- Supervise Borough President's staff and/or Mitchell-Lama Task Force volunteers who will be assigned to assist with check-in of attendees at the beginning of the workshop at 8:00 p.m. (assuming that the event proceeds as scheduled). Please note that attendees will have pre-registered for the workshop earlier in the evening. If there are vacant seats in the workshop room and event attendees did not pre-register for the workshop earlier in the evening, they may attend the workshop, but must sign-in on the attendance form.
- Monitor the time of each speaker. Calculate the allotted time for each speaker based upon the number of speakers, a minimum of 10 minutes for questions and answers at the conclusion of each speaker's presentation, assuming one hour for the workshop 8:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. (or if the workshop starts late and you are instructed by Borough President's staff to end prior to the completion of an hour, then do so and recalculate projected start and completion times for each speaker and questions and answers.
- Ensure that the workshop is conducted in an orderly process.
- Ensure that each speaker is provided with a sufficient amount of time to do their presentation (you may wish to ask each speaker before the workshop begins, how long they intend to speak).
- Familiarize yourself with the speaker's bio (if there is time) and give a brief introduction, based upon their bios, of each speaker.
- At the conclusion of the final speaker's presentation, do the following:
  - o Open up the floor to questions, based upon the amount of time remaining,
  - o Close the Q&A part of the workshop 2-3 minutes before the assigned time.
  - o Thank each speaker by name for their presentation(s). o Thank the Borough President's staff and/or Mitchell-Lama Task Force members for their assistance, o Thank the attendees on behalf of the Borough President for their

participation in the workshop and in the event, o Provide the following:

- Borough President's Community Service Center-(718) 802-3777
- Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Hotline-(718) 802-3949
- Borough President's General Number-(718) 802-3700
- Borough President's Website-www.brooklyn-usa.org
- Ask attendees to complete a workshop and event evaluation form at the
  conclusion of the workshop and submit it in the evaluation box on the ground
  floor lobby. Please note that the forms may be completed anonymously if
  attendees prefer.



# BROOKLETS' BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S MITCHELL-LAMA TASK FORCE

#### **MISSION STATEMENT**

"ESTABLISHED IN NOVEMBER 2003 BY BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT MARTY MARKOWITZ, THE MISSION OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S MITCHELL-LAMA TASK FORCE IS TO PRESERVE MITCHELL-LAMA HOUSING AS THE BASTION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THE TASK FORCE, WHICH MEETS AT BROOKLYN BOROUGH HALL, IS RESPONSIBLE FOR IDENTIFYING, EVALUATING, AND SEEKING RESOLUTION OF ALL HOUSING ISSUES AFFECTING THE RESIDENTS OF MITCHELL-LAMA DEVELOPMENTS. THE TASK FORCE SERVES AT THE PLEASURE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT, AS A VOLUNTARY BODY OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S OFFICE."

**BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT** 

**MAJEfTY** 

**MARKOWITZ** 

SEPTEMBER, 2004

#### PANELISTS AND WORKSHOP SPEAKERS

#### PANELISTS (BY ORDER IN WHICH THEY WILL SPEAK)

ELLEN, IRIZARRY, SENIOR HOUSING MANAGEMENT REPRESENTATIVE HOUSING .MANAGEMENT BUREAU NYS DIVISION OF HOUSING & COMMUNITY RENEWAL

ELAINE SMITH, DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES HOUSING SUPERVISION, NYC DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING PRESERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT

CAROL MAITLAND, CHIEF OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT OFFICE OF MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING US DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING & URBAN DEVELOPMENT

CHRISTOPHER INGRAM
DIRECTOR
SECTION 8 VOUCHER DIVISION
OFFICE OF PUBLIC HOUSING
US DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING & URBAN DEVELOPMENT

GLADYS ANDERSON, PUBLIC TRUST OFFICER OFFICE OF MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING US DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING & URBAN DEVELOPMENT

ROBERT DALY DIRECTOR PLUMBING AND BOILERS NYC DEPARTMENT OF BUILDINGS

HARRY VYAS
ACTING DIRECTOR
DIVISION OF ELEVATORS
NYC DEPARTMENT OF BUILDINGS

GREG BROOKS
DEPUTY COMPTROLLER
POLICY, AUDIT, CONTRACTS & ACCOUNTANCY
OFFICE OF THE NEW YORK CITY COMPTROLLER

#### BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA DAY PANELISTS AND WORKSHOP SPEAKERS PAGE 2

JULIE OKONIEWSKI LEGISLATIVE ASSISTANT HOUSE SUBCOMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND COMMUNITY OPPORTUNITY US CONGRESSWOMAN NYDIA VELASQUEZ

DANIEL WILEY COMMUNITY COORDINATOR US CONGRESSWOMAN NYDIA VELASQUEZ

URMAS NAERIS, CHIEF CREDIT OFFICER CREDIT RISK UNIT NYC HOUSING DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

CHRISTINA FLYNN, FINANCIAL ANALYST

NYC HOUSING DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

TOTAL = 12

#### WORKSHOP SPEAKERS

ANDREA FOLEY-MURPHY PRESERVATION COORDINATOR TENANTS & NEIGHBORS

MICHAEL KANE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NATIONALT ALLIANCE OF HUD TENANTS

DINA LEVY DIRECTOR OF ORGANIZING URBAN HOMESTEAD ASSISTANCE BOARD

SATEESH NORI STAFF ATTORNEY LEGAL AID SOCIETY BROOKLYN NEIGHBORHOOD OFFICE

#### BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA DAY PANELISTS AND WORKSHOP SPEAKERS PAGE 3

LOUISE SANCHEZ CO-CHAIRPERSON MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS COALITION

MARGARETTA HOMSEY TENANT ORGANIZER TENANTS & NEIGHBORS

ABBEY GOLDSTEIN, ESQ. GOLDSTEIN & GREENLAW

JAMES D. GARST BOARD MEMBER MITCHELL-LAMA COUNCIL

ED JOSEPHSON, ESQ. DIRECTOR OF LITIGATION SOUTH BROOKLYN LEGAL SERVICES

KEVIN MCCONNELL, ESQ. HIMMELSTEIN, MCCONNELL, GRIBBEN, DONOGHUE & JOSEPH

CHUCK BRASS SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT COMMUNITY PRESERVATION CORPORATION

JOE LAMPORT ASSISTANT DIRECTOR CITY-WIDE, TASK FORCE ON HOUSING COURT

TOTAL = 12



April 8, 2005

Mrs. Terry Rodie District Manager Community Board 14 810 East 16th Street Brooklyn, NY 11230

Dear Mrs. Rodie:

On behalf of the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force, Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and Tenants & Neighbors, I am writing to invite you to **Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day: An Informational Forum for Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Residents** to be held on Tuesday, April 19<sup>th</sup>, 2005, 5:30 p.m. to 9:00 p.m., at Brooklyn Borough Hall, 209 Joralemon Street.

This event will be open to residents of Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama developments and will address a wide range of issues and legislation affecting Mitchell-Lama rentals and coops such as: (1) Federal, State and City funding of Mitchell-Lama programs; (2) Mitchell-Lama buyouts; (3) Mitchell-Lama development building issues such as quality-of-life, maintenance and security; (4) Tenant organizing in Mitchell-Lama rentals; and (5) Problems endemic to Mitchell-Lama coops including by-laws and organizational requirements.

Please contact Mr. Eric Fleischman, my Housing Specialist, at (718) 802-3870 to confirm your attendance at the event.

I look forward to greeting you on April 19th.

Marty Markowitz

Sincerely,



April 8, 2005

Honorable Betsy Gotbaum Public Advocate Municipal Building One Centre Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Ms. Gotbaum:

On behalf of the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force, Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and Tenants & Neighbors, I am writing to invite you to **Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day: An Informational Forum for Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Residents** to be held on Tuesday, April 19<sup>th</sup>, 2005, 5:30 p.m. to 9:00 p.m., at Brooklyn Borough Hall, 209 Joralemon Street. If you are available, there will be a brief opportunity during the Opening Ceremony, from 6:00 p.m. to 6:30 p.m., for you to address the participants.

This event will be open to residents of Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama developments and will address a wide range of issues and legislation affecting Mitchell-Lama rentals and coops such as: (1) Federal, State and City funding of Mitchell-Lama programs; (2) Mitchell-Lama buyouts; (3) Mitchell-Lama development building issues such as quality-of-life, maintenance and security; (4) Tenant organizing in Mitchell-Lama rentals; and (5) Problems endemic to Mitchell-Lama coops including by-laws and organizational requirements.

Please contact Mr. Eric Fleischman, my Housing Specialist, at (718) 802-3870 to confirm your attendance at the event.

I look forward to greeting you on April 19th.

Sincerely,

Marty Markowitz



April 8, 2005

Honorable Simcha Felder New York City Council 4424 16th Avenue Brooklyn, NY 11204

Dear Honorable Felder:

On behalf of the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force, Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and Tenants & Neighbors, I am writing to invite you to **Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day: An Informational Forum for Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Residents** to be held on Tuesday, April 19<sup>th</sup>, 2005, 5:30 p.m. to 9:00 p.m., at Brooklyn Borough Hall, 209 Joralemon Street. If you are available, there will be a brief opportunity during the Opening Ceremony, from 6:00 p.m. to 6:30 p.m., for you to address the participants.

This event will be open to residents of Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama developments and will address a wide range of issues and legislation affecting Mitchell-Lama rentals and coops such as: (1) Federal, State and City funding of Mitchell-Lama programs; (2) Mitchell-Lama buyouts; (3) Mitchell-Lama development building issues such as quality-of-life, maintenance and security; (4) Tenant organizing in Mitchell-Lama rentals; and (5) Problems endemic to Mitchell-Lama coops including by-laws and organizational requirements.

Please contact Mr. Eric Fleischman, my Housing Specialist, at (718) 802-3870 to confirm your attendance at the event.

I look forward to greeting you on April 19th.

Sincerely,

Marty Markowitz



April 8, 2005

Honorable Vito J. Lopez New York State Assembly 434 South 5th Street Brooklyn, NY 11211

Dear Honorable Lopez:

On behalf of the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force, Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and Tenants & Neighbors, I am writing to invite you to **Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day: An Informational Forum for Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Residents** to be held on Tuesday, April 19<sup>th</sup>, 2005, 5:30 p.m. to 9:00 p.m., at Brooklyn Borough Hall, 209 Joralemon Street. If you are available, there will be a brief opportunity during the Opening Ceremony, from 6:00 p.m. to 6:30 p.m., for you to address the participants.

This event will be open to residents of Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama developments and will address a wide range of issues and legislation affecting Mitchell-Lama rentals and coops such as: (1) Federal, State and City funding of Mitchell-Lama programs; (2) Mitchell-Lama buyouts; (3) Mitchell-Lama development building issues such as quality-of-life, maintenance and security; (4) Tenant organizing in Mitchell-Lama rentals; and (5) Problems endemic to Mitchell-Lama coops including by-laws and organizational requirements.

Please contact Mr. Eric Fleischman, my Housing Specialist, at (718) 802-3870 to confirm your attendance at the event.

I look forward to greeting you on April 19th.

Sincerely,

Marty Markowitz

MM/ef



April 8, 2005

Honorable Velmanette Montgomery New York State Senate 30 Third Avenue; Room 615 Brooklyn, NY 11217

Dear Honorable Montgomery:

On behalf of the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force, Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and Tenants & Neighbors, I am writing to invite you to **Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day: An Informational Forum for Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Residents** to be held on Tuesday, April 19<sup>th</sup>, 2005, 5:30 p.m. to 9:00 p.m., at Brooklyn Borough Hall, 209 Joralemon Street. If you are available, there will be a brief opportunity during the Opening Ceremony, from 6:00 p.m. to 6:30 p.m., for you to address the participants.

This event will be open to residents of Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama developments and will address a wide range of issues and legislation affecting Mitchell-Lama rentals and coops such as: (1) Federal, State and City funding of Mitchell-Lama programs; (2) Mitchell-Lama buyouts; (3) Mitchell-Lama development building issues such as quality-of-life, maintenance and security; (4) Tenant organizing in Mitchell-Lama rentals; and (5) Problems endemic to Mitchell-Lama coops including by-laws and organizational requirements.

Please contact Mr. Eric Fleischman, my Housing Specialist, at (718) 802-3870 to confirm your attendance at the event.

I look forward to greeting you on April 19th.

Sincerely,

Marty Markowitz

MM/ef



April 8, 2005

Honorable Edolphus Towns Member of Congress 26 Court Street, ISthFl. Brooklyn, NY 11201

Dear Honorable Towns:

On behalf of the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force, Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and Tenants & Neighbors, I am writing to invite you to **Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day: An Informational Forum for Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Residents** to be held on Tuesday, April 19<sup>th</sup>, 2005, 5:30 p.m. to 9:00 p.m., at Brooklyn Borough Hall, 209 Joralemon Street. If you are available, there will be a brief opportunity during the Opening Ceremony, from 6:00 p.m. to 6:30 p.m., for you to address the participants.

This event will be open to residents of Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama developments and will address a wide range of issues and legislation affecting Mitchell-Lama rentals and coops such as: (1) Federal, State and City funding of Mitchell-Lama programs; (2) Mitchell-Lama buyouts; (3) Mitchell-Lama development building issues such as quality-of-life, maintenance and security; (4) Tenant organizing in Mitchell-Lama rentals; and (5) Problems endemic to Mitchell-Lama coops including by-laws and organizational requirements.

Please contact Mr. Eric Fleischman, my Housing Specialist, at (718) 802-3870 to confirm your attendance at the event.

I look forward to greeting you on April 19th.

Sincerely,

Marty Markowitz

MM/ef

#### INFORMATION TABLES

MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS COALITION
TENANTS & NEIGHBORS
ASTELLA DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION
SUNSET PARK REDEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

#### **SPONSORS**

MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS COALITION
TENANTS & NEIGHBORS
ASTELLA DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

#### **BCAT VIEWING DATE:**

APRIL 26TH AT KOO P.M. AND 9IOO P.M. CHANNELS 56 (TIME WARNER) 69 (CABLEVISION)

#### OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT:

(718) 802-3700 main number www.brooklyn-usa.org

ASKMARTY@BROOKLYNBP.NYC.GOV

COMMUNITY SERVICE CENTER: (718) 802-3777 MITCHELL-LAMA HOTLINE: (718) 802-3949



# BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT MARTY MARKOWITZ'

MITCHELL-LAMA TASK FORCE

MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS COALITION

AND

**TENANTS & NEIGHBORS** 

**PRESENT** 

## BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA DAY

AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

TUESDAY, APRIL 19, 2005 5:30 P.M. - 9:00 P.M.

**BROOKLYN BOROUGH HALL, 209 JORALEMON STREET** 

#### REGISTRATION

(CHECK-IN, INFORMATION TABLES, REFRESHMENTS)

5:30 P.M. - 6:00 P.M.

**OPENING CEREMONJY** 

6:OO P.M. - 6:30 P.M.

## WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS BOROUGH PRESIDENT MARTY MARKOWITZ

#### **REMARKS**

LOUISE SANCHEZ, CO-CHAIRPERSON
MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS COALITION

JUMAANE WILLIAMS, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
TENANTS & NEIGHBORS

#### PANEL

(COURTROOM/COMMUNITY ROOM) 6:30 P.M. - 7:45 P.M.

#### **MODERATOR**

JUDGE ELLIS SHEILA FRANKE OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

**TOPIC:** "FEDERAL, STATE AND CITY LEGISLATION AND FUNDING: ITS IMPACT ON MITCHELL-LAMA PROGRAMS\*'

#### BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT MARTY MARKOWITZ MITCHELL-LAMA TASK FORCE

#### **OFFICERS**

FREDERICK C. ARRIAGA, COUNSEL, ACTING CHAIRPERSON, OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

JUDGE ELLIS SHEIA FRANKE, CHAIRPERSON EMERITUS, OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

ERIC FLEISCHMAN, HOUSING SPECIALIST, VICE CHAIR, OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

NAOMI CH APPELLE, SECRETARY, MITCHELL-LAMA TASK FORCE-LINDSAY PARK HOUSING CORP.

BERNICE WINFREY, ALTERNATE SECRETARY, MITCHELL-LAMA TASK FORCE-LINDSAY PARK HOUSING CORP.

MARCO BROWN-TUNSTALL, CHAIRPERSON, BUILDING COMMITTEE-SEA PARK EAST

ETHELINE DASH, VICE CHAIRPERSON, BUILDING COMMITTEE-LINDSAY PARK HOUSING CORP.

BEATRICE TOMLINSON, ALTERNATE SECRETARY, BUILDING COMMITTEE-LINDSAY PARK HOUSING CORP.

KUMALI ZAIREE, ACTING CHAIRPERSON, OUTREACH & PUBLIC INFORMATION COMMITTEE-SEA PARK NORTH

ANNIE WISE, VICE CHAIR OUTREACH & PUBLIC INFORMATION COMMITTEE-ATLANTIC PLAZA

#### **MEMBERS**

ELIZABETH BROWN, TIVOLI TOWERS SOPHIE BUCHHOLTZ, WARBASSE HOUSES VIRGINIA BURROUGHS, ESSEX TERRACE

ADELINE CARRINGTON, EARL W. IIMMERSON APARTMENTS

. ALFREIDA DAVIS.SEA RISE I & II / BAY PARK ONE \* Two HOUSES

AUDREY DAVIS, ST. JAMES TOWERS

CORA Dix,-AUSTIN, LINDSAY PARK HOUSING CORP.

MARY FLOYD, FULTON PARK PLAZA

LEONARD GRANT, OCEAN TOWERS

ROMAN HARRIS, SEA RISE I & II / BAY PARK ONE \* Two HOUSES

VANESSA JONES, ATLANTIC PLAZA

GEARLDINE KINLEY, FULTON PARK PLAZA

ETTA LOADHOLT, ATLANTIC PLAZA

ANGUS KIRKLAND, MARCUS GARVEY VILLAGE

YOLANDA MATHEWS, MARCUS GARVEY VILLAGE

MONICA McINTYRE, HARRY SILVER HOUSING

ALICE MITCHELL, TIVOLI TOWERS

ETHEL SAMUELS, MARCUS GARVEY VILLAGE

CYNTHIA SANCHEZ, HARBOR VIEW

STELLA WEISBURG, BRIGHTON HOUSE

PATRICIA WINSTON, ATLANTIC PLAZA

#### **WOKKSHOPS**

8:00 P.M. - 9:00 P.M.

WORKSHOP (A):

"FEDERAL, STATE AND CITY LEGISLATION AND FUNDING: ITS IMPACT ON MITCHELL-LAMA PROGRAMS"

MODERATOR:

RICHARD BEARAK, DEPUTY DIRECTOR, PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

SPEAKERS:

ANDREA FOLEY-MURPHY, PRESERVATION COORDINATOR TENANTS & NEIGHBORS

MICHAEL KANE, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR NATIONAL ALLIANCE OF HUD TENANTS

TENANT REPRESENTATIVE:
ALICE MITCHELL, BOARD ADVISOR FOR TENANTS ASSOCIATION
TIVOLI TOWERS

WORKSHOP (B):

"MITCHELL-LAMA DEVELOPMENT BUILDING ISSUES (Coops & RENTALS):

Quality-of-life issues, maintenance and security"

MODERATOR:

FREDERICK C. ARRIAGA, COUNSEL OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

SPEAKERS:

DINA LEVY, DIRECTOR OF TENANT ORGANIZING URBAN HOMESTEAD ASSISTANCE BOARD

SATEESSH NORI STAFF ATTORNEY LEGAL AID SOCIETY WORKSHOP (C): "TENANT ORGANIZING IN MITCHELL-LAMA RENTALS"

MODERATOR:

TARA MARTIN, DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY
RELATIONS OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH
PRESIDENT

SPEAKERS:

LOUISE SANCHEZ, CO-CHAIRPERSON MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS COALITION

MARGARETTA HOMSEY, TENANT ORGANIZER
TENANTS & NEIGHBORS

TENANT REPRESENTATIVE:
MONICA McINTYRE, SHARE HOLDER
HARRY SILVER HOUSING

BROOKLYN NEIGHBORHOOD OFFICE

TENANT REPRESENTATIVE:
NAOMI CHAPPELLE, BOARD MEMBER
LINDSAY PARK HOUSING CORPORATION

#### WORKSHOP (D):

"MITCHELL-LAMA COOPS: BY-LAWS, DISSEMINATION OF INFORMATION AND LEGISLATIVE CONCERNS"

#### MODERATOR:

JUDGE ELLIS SHEILA FRANKE OFFICE OF THE BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

SPEAKERS:

ABBEY GOLDSTEIN, Esq. GOLDSTEIN & GREENLAW

JAMES D. GARST, BOARD MEMBER MITCHELL-LAMA COUNCIL

COOP REPRESENTATIVE; ANNIE WISE, PRESIDENT OF COOP BOARD EARL W. JIMMERSON HOUSING, INC. **WORKSHOP** (E): "MITCHELL-LAMA BUYOUT PROCESS"

MODERATOR:

JUMAANE WILLIAMS, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

TENANTS & NEIGHBORS

SPEAKERS:

EDWARD JOSEPHSON, ESQ., DIRECTOR OF LITIGATION SOUTH BROOKLYN LEGAL SERVICES

KEVIN R. MCCONNELL, ESQ.
HIMMELSTEIN, McCONNELL, GRIBBEN, DONOGHUE & JOSEPH

CHARLES A. BRASS, SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT COMMUNITY PRESERVATION CORPORATION

JOE LAMPORT, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR CITY-WIDE TASK FORCE ON HOUSING COURT

TENANT REPRESENTATIVE:

MARGO BROWN-TUNSTALL, TENANT ASSOCIATION PRESIDENT
SEA PARK EAST

#### **PANELISTS**

CAROL MAITLAND

CHIEF OF PROIECT MANAGEMENT
OFFICE OP MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING
US DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING & URBAN DEVELOPMENT

CHRISTOPHER INGRAM

DIRECTOR OP SECTION 8 VOUCHER DIVISION
OFFICE OF PUBLIC HOUSING US
DEPARTMENT OP HOUSING IT URBAN DEVELOPMENT

#### GLADYS ANDERSON

SENIOR TRUST OFFICER, OFFICE OP MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING US DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING \* URBAN DEVELOPMENT

ELLEN IRLZARRY SENIOR
HOUSING MANAGEMENT REPRESENTATIVE
HOUSING MANAGEMENT BUREAU NYS
DIVISION OP HOUSING & COMMUNITY RENEWAL

#### ELAINE SMITH

DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES, HOUSING SUPERVISION NYC DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING PRESERVATION AND DEVELOPMET

#### HARRY VYAS

ACTING DIRECTOR, ELEVATOR DIVISION NYC DEPARTMENT OP BUILDINGS

#### ROBERT DALY

DIRECTOR PLUMBING AND BOILERS DIVISION NYC DEPARTMENT OP BUILDINGS

#### GREG BROOKS

DEPUTY COMPTROLLER
POLICY, AUDIT, CONTRACTS & ACCOUNTANCY
OFFICE OP THE NEW YORK CITY COMPTROLLER

#### DANIEL WILEY

COMMUNITY COORDINATOR US CONGRESSWOMAN NYDIA VELASQUEZ

#### JULIE OKONIBWSKI

LEGISLATIVE ASSISTANT HOUSE
SUBCOMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND
COMMUNITY OPPORTUNITY US
CONGRESSWOMAN NYDIA VELASQUEZ



To: Marty Markowitz

From: Eric Demby

Date: Tuesday, April 19, 2005......5:30 - 9:00 p.m.

Re: Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day

**BH Courtroom Best** 

Time: 6 p.m.

This is an informational forum and workshops for Brooklyn residents of Mitchell-Lama housing, presented by your Mitchell-Lama Task Force, the Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition, and Tenants & Neighbors.

Astella Development Corp. is an additional sponsor.

The event will be broadcast on BCAT next Tuesday, April 26.

You will make welcoming remarks to open the event, then introduce Louise Sanchez, Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition Co-Chair, and Jumaane Williams, Tenants & Neighbors Exec. Dir.

The opening portion will be followed by a panel discussion moderated by Judge Franke, and break-out workshops moderated by Richard Bearak, Fred Arriaga, Tara Martin, and Jumannee Williams. These workshops will help Mitchell-Lama residents to identify issues and concerns with rental and co-op developments.

At the end of your remarks you will introduce Louis Sanchez to speak. She, in turn, will introduce Jumaane Williams to speak. When Jumaane concludes, you will return to the podium to present them with a proclamation. After the presentation, they will return to their seats and you will introduce Judge Ellis Sheila Franke to speak.

WELCOME TO CITY HALL — THE CITY OF BROOKLYN.
I WANT TO THANK THE INDIVIDUALS AND GROUPS
WHO MADE THIS MITCHELL-LAMA FORUM POSSIBLE —
STARTING WITH THE MEMBERS OF MY MITCHELLLAMA TASK FORCE, WHOSE DEDICATION MADE THIS
IMPORTANT EVENT A REALITY.

I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE A MOMENT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS HERE WITH US TONIGHT.
PLEASE STAND UP.

• [Wait for them to stand.]

I ALSO WANT TO THANK THE MITCHELL-LAMA
RESIDENTS COALITION AND ITS CO-CHAIR LOUISE SANCHEZ

TENANTS AND NEIGHBORS AND ITS EXECUTIVE

DIRECTOR JEW-MAWNY WILLIAMS —

ASTELLA DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION AND ITS

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR JUDI ORLANDO —

AND ALL THE MITCHELL-LAMA TENANTS AND OWNERS

WHO TOOK THE TIME TO JOIN US HERE TONIGHT.

THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH.

AFFORDABLE, SAFE, AND DECENT HOUSING IS THE FOUNDATION OF A COMMUNITY'S STABILITY.

NEW YORK STATE'S MITCHELL-LAMA PROGRAM HAS BEEN THE CORNERSTONE OF THAT FOUNDATION OVER THE LAST HALF-CENTURY, CREATING MORE THAN 100,000 HOUSING UNITS FOR WORKING FAMILIES AT 269 SITES ACROSS THE STATE.

IN 1955, MANHATTAN STATE SENATOR MACNEIL MITCHELL AND BROOKLYN ASSEMBLYMAN ALFRED LAMA HAD THE KIND OF VISION THAT AMERICA SORELY LACKS TODAY — THAT BUILDING AND PRESERVING HOUSING AFFORDABLE FOR ALL CITIZENS SHOULD BE JOB ONE FOR OUR GOVERNMENT.

BECAUSE BUILDING NEW AFFORDABLE HOUSING HAS BECOME VERY DIFFICULT IN TODAY'S RED HOT REAL ESTATE MARKET — WE MUST RE-DOUBLE OUR EFFORTS TO MAINTAIN THE AFFORDABLE UNITS WE HAVE, ESPECIALLY THOSE IN MITCHELL-LAMA BUILDINGS.

EACH TIME A MITCHELL-LAMA UNIT IS LOST TO A BUY
OUT OR TO PRIVATIZATION, A SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC
OPPORTUNITY FOR A HARD-WORKING INDIVIDUAL OR
FAMILY IS LOST —

AND THE FOUNDATION OF OUR COMMUNITY'S STABILITY CRUMBLES A LITTLE BIT MORE.

I NEVER WANT TO SEE A TIME IN BROOKLYN WHEN
THERE ARE MULTIMILLIONAIRES AND THOSE WHO LIVE IN
PUBLIC HOUSING — AND NOTHING IN BETWEEN.

BUT IF WE DO NOT PROTECT THE DWINDLING NUMBERS OF MITCHELL-LAMA UNITS — AND STAND UP FOR THE EQUALITY OF OPPORTUNITY THEY REPRESENT — WE RISK EDGING CLOSER TO THAT REALITY.

WE SIMPLY CANNOT LET THESE UNITS SLIP AWAY.

THE LOSS OF ARTISTS' HOUSING AT MIDDAGH STREET AND THE RECENT BUYOUTS IN CONEY ISLAND ARE POTENTIALLY JUST THE TIP OF THE ICEBERG FOR AN IMPENDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING CRISIS IN BROOKLYN.

WITHIN THE NEXT DECADE, BROOKLYN COULD LOSE ONE THIRD OF ITS 30,000 RENTAL AND CO-OP MITCHELL-LAMA UNITS.

TO PRESERVE LONG-TERM AFFORD ABILITY, WE MUST WORK TOGETHER TO RENEW AND STRENGTHEN EXISTING RENT LAWS — PRESERVE AND FIGHT FOR MORE ENHANCED SECTION 8 VOUCHERS — AND CREATE ATTRACTIVE FINANCIAL INCENTIVES.

I COMMEND THE CITY'S NEW INITIATIVE TO OFFER LOW-INTEREST LOANS AS AN INCENTIVE FOR DEVELOPMENTS TO REMAIN IN MITCHELL-LAMA AS A STEP IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION.

BUT WITHOUT ADDITIONAL SOLUTIONS, THE LIMITED OPPORTUNITIES FOR BUILDING NEW AFFORDABLE UNITS TODAY WILL CONTINUE TO BE OFFSET BY MITCHELL-LAMA BUYOUTS AND PRIVATIZATION -

BY LUXURY DE-CONTROL OF RENT STABILIZED UNITS - AND BY GENTRIFICATION OF NON-STABILIZED UNITS.

I AM CONFIDENT THAT TONIGHT'S DISCUSSIONS
AMONG HOUSING EXPERTS AND BROOKLYNITES WILL LEAD
TO FURTHER COOPERATION AND TO MORE INNOVATIVE
WAYS TO PRESERVE BROOKLYN'S MITCHELL-LAMA UNITS.

WORKING TOGETHER, WE CAN AND WE MUST
CONSTRUCT A STRONGER FOUNDATION FOR AFFORDABLE
HOUSING IN BROOKLYN —

BECAUSE JUST AS EVERY BUILDING NEEDS A SOLID FOUNDATION -

EVERY FAMILY NEEDS A SOLID BUILDING THEY KNOW THEY CAN CALL HOME.

NOW IT GIVES ME GREAT PLEASURE TO INTRODUCE SOMEONE WHO HAS BEEN A LEADER OF THE MITCHELL LAMA RESIDENTS COALITION FOR MANY YEARS, AND IS CURRENTLY ITS CO-CHAIR - LOUISE SANCHEZ.

(You will return to your seat until after Jumaane Williams speaks, at which time you will return to the podium.)

I WANT TO ASK LOUISE AND JEW-MAWNY TO COME BACK TO THE PODIUM FOR JUST A MOMENT.

(Present them with the proclamation.)
THANK YOU BOTH.

NOW, I AM DELIGHTED TO INTRODUCE SOMEONE WHO SERVED AS A HOUSING COURT JUDGE UNTIL VERY RECENTLY.

SHE IS NOW ENJOYING A VERY ACTIVE RETIREMENT - WHICH INCLUDES SERVING AS A VOLUNTEER ON HOUSING ISSUES FOR MY OFFICE.

PLEASE WELCOME JUDGE ELLIS SHEILA FRANKE.

## AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

#### Co-Sponsor

#### Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition

#### Louise Sanchez

Louise Sanchez is currently the Co-Chair and has been for the past seven to eight years, of the Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition, a statewide tenants' advocacy organization. The Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition is the only organization which includes both renters and coops. Ms. Sanchez has also been the President of the National Alliance of HUD tenants (NAHT). NAHT is the only tenants union representing Section 8 tenants and other subsidized tenants in HUD housing in the private sector.

#### Co-Sponsor

#### Tenants & Neighbors Jumaane D. Williams

In January 2005, Jumaane D. Williams joined NYS Tenants & Neighbors (T&N) as the organization's Executive Director. He plans to build on the organization's 30-year history of coalition building, tenant advocacy and move forward on the issue of affordable housing, particularly T&N's major campaigns—rent regulation and subsidized housing. Mr. Williams previously served as the Director of Housing at Flatbush Development Corporation (FDC) in Brooklyn, where he managed two government contracts and helped to revamp FDC's housing services; organizing dozens of buildings, assisting hundreds of tenants, preventing evictions for many, as well as providing free workshops to the community and homeownership services for first-time homebuyers. Mr. Williams also organized two successful neighborhood-based committees, the Anti-Graffiti Taskforce and Housing Committee. Prior to working at FDC, he was the Acting Executive Director of the Flatbush East Community Development Corporation (FECDC). He currently sits on the Tourette Syndromes' Association Multi-Cultural Committee. He is also a member of both the Futurama Civic Association in Brooklyn, and Community Board 18's Youth and Zoning and Planning Committees in Brooklyn.

## AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

#### **PANEL TOPIC:**

## "FEDERAL, STATE AND CITY LEGISLATION AND FUNDING: IT'S IMPACT ON MITCHELL-LAMA PROGRAMS"

#### **Moderator**

#### Judge Ellis Sheila Franke Office of the Brooklyn Borough President

#### **Speakers**

#### **Ellen Irizarry**

Ellen Irizarry is a Senior Housing Management Representative at the NYS Division of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR). As a Senior Housing Management Representative, she currently supervises a field unit whose housing management representatives oversee the operations of federally assisted, non-federally assisted, and cooperative housing companies.

#### **Elaine Smith**

Elaine Smith is the Director of Administrative Services for the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development's (HPD) City Mitchell-Lama developments. She is responsible for admissions, transfers, income affidavits and surcharges for the rental and cooperative City Mitchell-Lama developments and is thoroughly familiar with the Mitchell-Lama rules regarding these issues.

#### **Carol Maitland**

Carol Maitland is the Chief of Project Management in the New York Multi-family Housing Division of the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). She is responsible for monitoring and evaluating the performance of owners, management agents and contract administrators who have contracted with HUD insured, non-insured, subsidized and non-subsidized rental housing in Brooklyn and cooperatives throughout New York State.

#### **Christopher Ingram**

Christopher Ingram is the Director of the Section 8 Voucher Division in the Office of Public Housing of the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). He has worked there for more than 13 years, mainly with the Section 8 Voucher program.

#### Gladys Anderson

Gladys Anderson is a Senior Trust Officer in the New York Multi-family Housing Division of the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). She is responsible for an inventory of insured, non-insured, subsidized and non-subsidized Brooklyn rentals and cooperatives throughout New York State. Her responsibilities include monitoring and evaluating the performance of owners, and management agents who have contracted with HUD.

#### Robert Daly

Robert Daly is the Director of Plumbing and Boilers at the NYC Department of Buildings (DOB). Mr. Daly has been with the DOB approximately one year after having been in the industry for more than 35 years. He is a licensed engineer in New Jersey and is awaiting his license in New York State.

#### Harry Vyas

Harry Vyas is the Acting Director of Elevators at the NYC Department of Buildings. Mr. Vyas is a degreed electrical engineer. Prior to being appointed Acting Director, he served as an Inspector, Supervising Inspector and Deputy Director of Operations.

#### **Greg Brooks**

Greg Brooks is New York City's Deputy Comptroller for Policy, Audit, Accountancy and Contracts. He also serves as the Comptroller's representative to the New York City Audit Committee and as a board member of the New York City Financial Information Services Agency. Before assuming his role as Deputy Comptroller, Mr. Brooks was the Executive Assistant/Chief of Staff to Brooklyn Borough President Howard Golden. Mr. Brooks was the Brooklyn member of the New York City Board of Education, a member of the Board of Directors of the New York City Economic Development Corporation and Founding Member and Vice President of the Brooklyn Bridge Park Development Corporation.

#### Julie Okoniewski

Julie Okoniewski is a Legislative Assistant for Congresswoman Nydia M. Velazquez in Brooklyn's 12<sup>th</sup> Congressional District, staffing the Congresswoman on the House Subcommittee on Housing and Community Opportunity. She covers all issues related to housing for the office including Section 8 vouchers, public housing, preserving affordable housing, predatory lending, and increasing opportunities for homeownership in low-income communities.

#### **Daniel Wiley**

Daniel Wiley is a Community Coordinator for Congresswoman Nydia M. Velazquez since 2000 covering a Brooklyn portion of her NY 12th Congressional District from the Brooklyn Navy Yard southwest through waterfront communities extending to Red Hook and Sunset Park. He keeps the Congresswoman informed on community issues and coordinates local projects and initiatives for her. Mr. Wiley has worked in Brooklyn since 1988 as an Education Program Coordinator for the Brooklyn Center for the Urban Environment (BCUE) focusing on urban architecture, social studies, neighborhood history, urban planning, and environmental issues and still conducts numerous public walking tours.

#### **Urmas Naeris**

Urmas Naeris is the Chief Credit Officer of the Credit Risk Department of the New York City Housing Development Corporation (HOC). He is responsible for reviewing each loan prior to financing. Mr. Naeris joined the corporation as Vice President of Development in August 2000. In this capacity, in addition to reviewing financing proposals and programs, he structured loan pools for securitization by the Corporation. Before joining HOC, Mr. Naeris served as the Chief Underwriter for New York City's Department of Housing Preservation and Development, where he designed, developed and administered programs using leveraged financing, tax incentives, rent subsidies, grants and various other incentives offered at the City, State and Federal levels.

#### Christina Flynn \

Christina Flynn is a Financial Analyst in the Credit Risk Department of the New York City Housing Development Corporation (HOC). In this capacity, Ms. Flynn has focused on financing more than 30 developments participating in HDC's Mitchell-Lama Preservation Program. Her responsibilities include underwriting transactions associated with the preservation program, managing the HUD §236 decoupling effort for participating properties, and facilitating the refinancing process for Mitchell-Lama owners and managing agents.

## AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

#### **WORKSHOP (A)**

#### **TOPIC:**

"FEDERAL, STATE AND CITY LEGISLATION AND FUNDING: IT'S IMPACT ON MITCHELL-LAMA PROGRAMS"

#### Moderator

Richard Bearak, Deputy Director Planning & Development Office of the Brooklyn Borough President

#### Speakers

#### Andrea Folev-Murphy

Andrea Foley-Murphy is the Preservation Coordinator at Tenants & Neighbors. She has been working with Tenants & Neighbors to preserve subsidized in New York since 2001. Ms. Foley-Murphy is responsible for Tenants & Neighbors' research and policy analysis activities and is currently working toward a Masters of Science in Urban Policy Analysis and Management from Milano Graduate School at the New School University.

#### Michael Kane

Michael Kane has been Executive Director of the National Alliance of HUD Tenants since 1994. He also serves as Director of the Massachusetts Alliance of HUD Tenants, based in Boston. Mr. Kane has 30 years of experience organizing in HUD subsidized multi-family housing.

#### **Tenant Representative**

#### **Alice Mitchell**

Alice Mitchell has been a resident of Tivoli Towers for the past twenty years on the fact-finding committee and is board advisor for the tenants association. She is a member of Tenants & Neighbors, the Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition, and the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force.

## AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

#### **WORKSHOP (B)**

#### TOPIC:

"MITCHELL-LAMA DEVELOPMENT BUILDING ISSUE (COOPS & RENTALS):
QUALITY-OF-LIFE ISSUES, MAINTENANCE AND SECURITY"

#### Moderator

Frederick C. Arriaga
Counsel to the Borough President
Office of the Brooklyn Borough President

#### **Speakers**

#### **Dina Levy**

Dina Levy is the Director of Organizing at the Urban Homesteading Assistance Board (UHAB), a city-wide non profit that assists tenants in converting their rental buildings into limited-equity cooperatives. Prior to this position Ms. Levy worked in Newark New Jersey and Dallas Texas organizing around affordable housing preservation, specifically HUD subsidized programs.

#### Sateesh Nori

Sateesh Nori is a staff attorney at the Legal Aid Society, Brooklyn Neighborhood Office where he practices housing law. Mr. Nori graduated from New York University Law school in 2001 and has been at Legal Aid in Brooklyn ever since. He is also the secretary/treasurer of the Housing Court Public Service Projects Committee of the Association of the Bar of the New York City. He also serves on the Board of Directors of LANSA-the Legal Access Network for South Asians- a legal services organization serving low-income immigrants in New York City.

#### **Tenant Representative**

#### Naomi Chappelle

Naomi Chappelle is the Secretary of the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force and its Building and Outreach & Public Information Committees. Ms. Chappelle is also an Executive Board Member of the Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition.

## AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

#### WORKSHOP (C)

#### **TOPIC: "TENANT ORGANIZING IN MITCHELL-LAMA**

**RENTALS**"

#### **Moderator**

Tara Martin
Director of Community Relations Office
of the Brooklyn Borough President

#### Speakers

#### **Louise Sanchez**

Louise Sanchez is currently the Co-Chair and has been for the past seven to eight years, of the Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition, a statewide tenants' advocacy organization. The Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition is the only organization which includes both renters and coops. Ms. Sanchez has also been the President of the National Alliance of HUD tenants (NAHT). NAHT is the only tenants union representing Section 8 tenants and other subsidized tenants in HUD housing in the private sector.

#### Margaretta Homsey

Margaretta Homsey has been a tenant organizer with New York State Tenants & Neighbors since August 2004, when she began a year of service with the organization through the Jesuit Volunteer Corps. She works in expiring and distressed project-based Section 8 buildings, aiding in the formation of tenant associations and providing technical assistance to help residents win contract extensions and building improvements.

#### Tenant Representative

#### **Monica McIntyre**

Monica MacIntyre has served on the board of Harry Silver Housing for twelve years in various positions, including president, treasurer and board member. Ms. MacIntyre is a board member of the Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and is a member of the Brooklyn Borough President Mitchell-Lama Task Force.

## AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

#### WORKSHOP (D)

#### **TOPIC:**

"MITCHELL-LAMA COOPS: BY-LAWS, DISSEMINATION OF INFORMATION AND LEGISLATIVE CONCERNS"

#### **Moderator**

Judge Ellis Sheila Franke Office of the Brooklyn Borough President

#### **Speakers**

#### **Abbey Goldstein**

Abbey Goldstein has been an attorney since 1970 and is a partner in the law firm of Goldstein & Greenlaw, which specializes in the representation of cooperatives and condominiums. Mr. Goldstein has served as Counsel to the Speaker of the Assembly from 1979-to 1983 and served as a New York City Tax Commissioner from 1983 through 1989. Mr. Goldstein has lectured on the subject of cooperatives and condominiums in many forums, including the Queens County Bar Association.

#### James D. Garst

James D. Garst is a resident in a Mitchell-Lama coop since 1967. Mr. Garst has been a member of the Board of Directors of the Mitchell Lama Council since 1969 and previously served as legislative representative of the Mitchell-Lama Council from 1971 to 1983. He was also a legislative representative of the NYS Tenant & Neighbor Coalition from 1983-1988.

#### **Coop Representative**

#### Annie M. Wise

Since 1994, Annie M. Wise has been the President of the Board of Directors for the Earl W. Jimerson Housing Company, Inc. and also serves as Vice Chairperson of the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force Outreach & Public Information Committee.

## AN INFORMATIONAL FORUM FOR BROOKLYN MITCHELL-LAMA RESIDENTS

#### **WORKSHOP (E)**

**TOPIC: "THE MITCHELL-LAMA BUYOUT** 

PROCESS"

#### **Moderator**

Jumaane Williams, Executive Director Tenants & Neighbors

#### **Speakers**

#### **Edward Josephson**

Edward Josephson is the Director of Litigation at South Brooklyn Legal Services, and from 1996-2003 was the Director of the Housing Law Unit. He has defended tenants in eviction proceedings since 1988. Mr. Josephson is currently litigating in Federal District and Bankruptcy courts to protect the rights of tenants in Federally subsidized Housing projects.

#### Kevin R. McConnell

Kevin R. McConnell is a partner in the firm of Himmelstein, McConnell, Gribben, Donoghue & Joseph. Mr. McConnell concentrates on tenants' rights in all aspects of landlord-tenant law with a particular emphasis on tenants' rights in Mitchell-Lama buy-outs and cooperative or condominium conversions. He previously served as a senior staff attorney in the Housing Unit of South Brooklyn Legal Services. He was also Assistant Attorney General in the Enforcement Division of the Bureau of Real Estate Financing, which regulates the offer and sale of cooperatives and condominiums. While an Assistant Attorney General he investigated and prosecuted civil and criminal violations of the conversion laws. In his current position, he has represented tenants and tenants associations in the conversion and buy-out process and has testified before the New York City Council in support of stronger protections for tenants throughout the buy-out process.

#### **Charles A. Brass**

Charles A. Brass is the Senior Vice President for Development for Community Preservation Corporation Resources, Inc. (CPC). At CPC Resources, Inc. he has sought to develop and preserve affordable housing properties in New York City and New York State. In addition, he provides consulting services to for-profit and not-forprofit developers of housing and mixed-use facilities, as well as governmental entities interested in developing such properties. Mr. Brass previously worked for the New York City Housing Development Corporation (HOC) as First Senior Vice President for Development and Policy, and then Executive Vice President and President. During his tenure at HOC, he was responsible for the creation and implementation of various taxexempt and taxable bond financing programs that have funded the development of more than 25,000 units of low, moderate and middle income rental and cooperative housing. Prior to joining HOC, Mr. Brass worked at the New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) where he worked both in the Policy and Intergovernmental as well as Development divisions of the agency. He was also CEO of the New York City Housing Partnership, the largest not-for-profit housing developer in New York City. Mr. Brass also served as President of the New York City Residential Mortgage Insurance Corporation, an HOC subsidiary that insures permanent loans made on affordable housing developments. Mr. Brass is also active in lobbying housing issues on the Federal level. He was President of the Board of the National Association of Local Housing Finance Agencies.

#### Joe Lamport

Joe Lamport is the Assistant Director of the City-Wide Task Force on Housing Court and the housing section editor for Gotham Gazette, an online news service.

#### **Tenant Representative**

#### Margo Brown-Tunstall

As a long-standing resident of Coney Island, Margo Brown-Tunstall is actively involved with civic and political issues affecting her community. Ms. Tunstall was instrumental in helping to organize the Brooklyn Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force. Ms. Tunstall is Chairperson of the Borough President's Mitchell-Lama Task Force Building Committee. She is also an Executive Board Member of the National Alliance of HUD Tenants, Resident Tenant Leader of Sea Park East, member of Tenants & Neighbors, member of the Neighborhood Advisory Board (District #24), and Executive Board Member of the Coney Island Community Coalition.

## PANEL AND WORKSHOPS SCHEDULE. LOCATION AND MAXIMUM NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS

#### WORKSHOP (A): Second Floor Conference Room

"Federal, State and City Legislation and Funding: It's Impact on Mitchell-Lama Programs"

Moderator: Richard Bearak, Deputy Director, Planning & Development, Office of the Brooklyn Borough President

Speaker: Andrea Foley-Murphy, Preservation Coordinator, Tenants & Neighbors Speaker: Michael Kane, Executive Director, National Alliance of HUD Tenants

Tenant Representative: Alice Mitchell, Tivoli Towers

Maximum Number of Possible Attendees: 20

#### WORKSHOP (B): Second Floor Courtroom

"Mitchell-Lama Development Building Issues (Coops & Rentals): Quality-of-Life Issues, Maintenance and Security"

Moderator: Frederick C. Arriaga, Counsel Office of the Brooklyn Borough President

Speaker: Dina Levy, Director of Tenant Organizing, Urban Homestead Assistance Board

Speaker:

Tenant Representative: Naomi Chappelle, Board Member, Lindsay Park Housing Corporation

Maximum Number of Possible Attendees: 100

#### WORKSHOP (C): First Floor Rotunda

"Tenant Organizing in Mitchell-Lama Rentals"

Moderator: Tara Martin, Director of Community Relations, Office of the Brooklyn Borough President

Speaker: Louise Sanchez, Co-Chairperson, Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition

Speaker: Margaretta Homsey, Tenant Organizer, Tenants & Neighbors Tenant Representative: Monica MacIntyre, Board Member, Harry Silver'Housing

Maximum Number of Possible Attendees: 50

#### WORKSHOP (D): First Floor Borough President's Conference Room

"Mitchell-Lama Coops: By-Laws, Dissemination of Information and Legislative Concerns"

Moderator: Judge Ellis Sheila Franke Speaker: Abbey Goldstein, Esq. (FIRM?)

Speaker: James D. Garst, Board Member, Mitchell-Lama Council

Coop Representative: Annie Wise, President, Coop Board, Earl W. Jimmerson Housing

Maximum Number of Possible Attendees: 84

#### WORKSHOP (E): First Floor Community Room

"The Mitchell-Lama Buyout Process"

Moderator: Jon Benguiat

Speaker: Ed Josephson, Esq., Director of Litigation, South Brooklyn Legal Services Speaker: Kevin McConnell, Esq., Himmelstein, McConnell, Gribben, Donoghue & Joseph Speaker: Chuck Brass, Senior Vice President, Community Preservation Corporation Speaker: Joe Lambort, Assistant Director, City-wide Task Force on Housing Court

Tenant Representative: Margo Brown-Tunstall, Tenant Association President, Sea Park East

Maximum Number of Participants: 90

Maximum Number of Participants for all workshops: 344



#### Mitchell-Lama Day Informational Forum

#### **WORKSHOP SELECTION FORM**

Please select the workshop you would like to attend by placing an "x" in the box to the right of the room assignment. You may only select **one** workshop. Please return this form to a Mitchell-Lama Staff Member/Volunteer (Blue Name Tag) as you enter the Courtroom or Community Room for the opening remarks and Panel discussion. NOTE: workshop room assignments may change.

cnange.					
Workshop A:	2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Conference Room	[	]		
Federal, State and Cit	y Legislation and Funding: It's	Impact on Mitchell-l	Lama Progr	ams:	
	rent governmental funding policies are Mitchell-Lama remains as viable		a Program an	d the need f	for increased and
Workshop B:	Courtroom - 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor			[	]
Mitchell-Lama Develo	pment Building issues (Coops &	Rentals): Quality-of	-Iife Issues,	Maintena	nce and
Security:			ŕ		
Learn what you can do to issues.	o get repairs made in your apartmen	nt and to address building	g/developme	nt maintena	nce and security
Workshop C:	Rotunda-1 <sup>st</sup> Floor			[	]
Tenant Organizing in	Mitchell-Lama Rentals:				
A discussion on how Mit	tchell-Lama rental tenants may effe	ctively organize their bu	ildings.		
Workshop D:	BP Conference Room-1 <sup>st</sup> Floor	r		]	]
Mitchell-Lama Coops:	By-Laws, Dissemination of Inform	nation and Legislative	Concerns:		
A discussion of internal	governance issues facing Mitchell-	Lama coop developmen	nts.		
Workshop E:	Community Room-1 <sup>st</sup> Floor			[	]
The Mitchell-Lama Buy	yout Process: This workshop will a	address "buy outs" and the	he rights of to	enants and	

non-purchasers.



#### Mitchell-Lama Legal Information:

The Mitchell-Lama program was created by the New York State Government under Article 2 of the Private Housing Finance Law (PHFL Art. II) to encourage the private development of low and middle income housing. The program encouraged such housing by offering State and municipal assistance to developers in the form of long-term, low-interest government mortgage loans and real estate tax exemptions. In return for these financial benefits, developers agree to regulations concerning rent, profit, disposition of property and tenant selection (see, PHFL §§ 20-23, 28, 31, 33; see generally 9 NYCRR §§ 1700 et. seq.).

The following are laws of interest to Mitchell-Lama residents:

The following are laws of interest to Mitchell-Lama residents:		
Current Statutes that apply to Mitchell-Lamas	State	City
95 Percent Financing Allowed	McKinney's NY Priv. Hous. Fin. Law §§ 22(2),23(1)	
Real Estate Tax Exemptions for Developers to encourage	McKinney's NY Priv. Hous. Fin. Law §§ 22(2), 23(1)	
middle-income housing		
Limits on Developer's profits and Income guidelines of		
incoming tenants	McKinney's NY Priv. Hous. Fin. Law § 31(3)	
Allows limited-profit housing companies to exist	McKinney's NY CLS Priv Hous Fin § 10	
Allows private housing companies dissolve as limited-profit		
housing companies	McKinney's Priv Hous Fin § 35(2),	
New York Emergency Tenant Protection Act applies to the		NYC Admin. Code §
buildings constructed prior to 1969		26-501
Historical Statues replaced by items above: State	City	1
Creation of the Original Mitchell-Lama Program	McKinney's NY CLS Pub Hous ^ 307-324	
1st Modification of Restrictions on 35-Year Buy-Out	McKinney's NY CLS Pub Hous ^ 307-324	
Reduction of Buy-Out to 15 Years, Major Modification		
of Restrictions	McKinney's NY CLS Pub Housing §§ 322-323	
Increase of Buy-Out Period to 20 Years	McKinney's NY CLS Soc Services §§ 482-dd- 483-b	
increase of Buy out reflor to 20 Tems	38 102 00 100 0	

There are multiple web resources which are useful for all Mitchell-Lama residents to review. The most recent state report on Mitchell-Lama housing is located on the New York State Division of Housing and Community Renewal website at <a href="http://www.dhcr.state.ny.us/ohm/pubs/html/mlhcar03toc.htm">http://www.dhcr.state.ny.us/ohm/pubs/html/mlhcar03toc.htm</a>. Also the Mitchell-Lama Resident Coalition has a comprehensive history of the Mitchell-Lama Buy-Out Provision located at <a href="http://www.mitchell-lama.org/history.htm">http://www.mitchell-lama.org/history.htm</a>.

#### Websites of interest:

Websites of Interest.				
Websites	Web Addresses			
New York State Division of Housing and Community				
Renewal	http://www.dhcr.state.ny.us/ohm/progs/mitchlam/ohmprgmi.htm			
New York Citv Housing Authority fNYCFLV)	http://www.ci.nyc.ny.us/html/nvcha/home.html			
New York City Department of Housing. Preservation				
and Development	http://www.ci.nyc.ny.us/html/hpd/home.html			
New York City Housing Development Corporation	http://www.nychdc.com/MitchellLama/mlfaq.htm			
Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition Home Page	http://www.mitchell-lama.org			



# Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day: An Informational Forum for Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Residents

#### **Evaluation Form**

Please take a few minutes to tell us about your experience at the Mitchell-Lama Information Forum at Brooklyn Borough Hall. The more details you provide, the more helpful your comments are.

(Please circle one of the following choices)'.

# Overall I would rate the Informational Forum as: Very Successful Somewhat Successful Average Somewhat Unsuccessful Unsuccessful I felt the length of the conference was: Just right Too long Too short I felt that having separate Panel and Workshop components was: Effective Somewhat effective Not effective The best part of the conference was:

(Please circle one of the following choices):

Please rate the following	ng: Exc	cellent	Avei	age	Poor
Schedule of Events	5	4	3	2	1
Conference Materials	5	4	3	2	1
Conference Registration	5	4	3	2	1
<b>Panel Presentation</b>	Exc	ellent	Aver	age	Poor
Topic	5	4	3	2	1
Presenters	5	4	3	2	1
Materials	5	4	3	2	1
Workshops	Exce	ellent	Aver	age	Poor
Topic	5	4	3	2	1
Presenters	5	4	3	2	1
Materials	5	4	3	2	1
Any other comments or suggestions:					
Optional:					
Name:					
Address:					
Tel: Email					

Please return this evaluation to a staff member/volunteer (blue nametag).

## Borough Hall Looks At the Future of Housing in Brooklyn

#### **By Joshua Davis**

The first-ever Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Day forum took place at Borough Hall last week and the paramount concern to the overflow crowd of Mitchell-Lama housing residents was buyouts.

"This is about saving our homes," said Cora Austin, President of Ihe Lindsay Park Housing Coip.

The event was created 10 inform and to listen to tenants and owners of Mitchell-Lama housing, a long-running government program designed to maintain affordable homes for moderate and middle income residents. The Mitchell-Lama.housing program gives tax incentives and public subsidies to buildings meeting criteria focused on maintaining long-term afforclability,

"Mitchell-Lama was the most successful housing program in the country," said Louise Sanchez, co-chair of the • Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition, the only statewide organization comprising of both tenants and owners.

Borough President Marty Markowitz agreed with Sanchez in his opening remarks before a panel that included representatives from the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development, the New York State Division of Housing and Community Renewal and Rep. Nydia Velazquez' office; Markowitz called Mitchell-Lama "the greatest housing that New York State ever produced." He said he hopes to talk about increasing the size of the Mitchell-Lama housing program rather than just preserving housing units, but his priority was clear.

"We simply cannot let these units slip away," he announced.

A 2004 report by Comptroller William C. Thompson, Jr. forecasts an abbreviated future for Mitchell-Lama. The report, "Affordable No More; New York City's Looming Crisis in Mitchell-Lama and Limited Dividend Hpusing,

cites at least 59 Mitchell-Lama developments that are According to the New York City Department of Housing scheduled to retire their subsidized mortgages in the next 10 Preservation and Development, there have been 30 buyouts years. This withdrawal from Mitchell-Lama housing to the since 1974. Carol Abrams, a HPD spokesperson, says thai private market points to the trend that residents commonly call of these 30 buyouts, 18 of these buildings have gone into "buyouts."

"Affordable housing is becoming an oxymoron," says tions. Sanchez, who predicted that buyouts would affect Brooklyn residents soon, if they have not yet already.

This warning raised concern for some area residents. Verdine Hinds, a co-op owner in a Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama building, is concerned that her building may opt out of the program.

rent stabilization and another seven have other rent protec-

"Mayor Bloomberg has introduced legislation in Albany to extent rent control protections for all tenants facing Mitchell-Lama buyouts," she said.

However, Abrams admits that rent control protections do not fully deal with Mitchell-Lama co-op owners whose directing board decided to opt out of the program. "Many



City Council member Letitia James and Borough President Marty Markowitz present a proclamation to Louise Sanchez, co-chair of the Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and Jumaane Williams executive director Tenants and Neighbors.

"I'm of retirement age and was hoping to retire there," she says. "I need to know what's going on'; Right now we don't know what's going on."

Mitchell-Lama co-op owners have a say whether their building remains in the program through their building's Board of Directors. Mitchell-Lama tenants have a limited or no say.

"The decision is their own," said Jay Silverberg, a managing agent dealing with Mitchell-Lama negotiations, of Mitchell-Lama co-op owners. "A lot of residents are confused by this." Silverberg has worked closely with Mitchell-Lama co-ops owners, including the Lindsay Park Housing Corp.

Mitchell-Lama housing was created in 1955 as a way to keep the middle class in the city. The program was originally sponsored by then Senator McNeil Mitchell and Assemblyman Alfred A. Lama and encouraged tax incentives for low and middle-income housing. According to Thompson's report, as of last year eleven developments representing more than 6,300 units have submitted notice to leave the housing programs.

"This has become a very serious issue," said Judge Ellis Franke, the forum's moderator and a volunteer with the Borough President's office. "We would like to have a mix of housing so everyone can find a decent place to live."

people believe and bought into a co-op style of living in the 70's," she said. "They do not want to have to Hip their apartments."

The Mitchell-Lama Day event was organi/ed by Markowitz Mitchell-Lama Task Force, the Mitchell-Lama Residents Coalition and Tenants & Neighbors.

"We're a unified front," said Austin, who also works with the Mitchell-Lama Task Force.

Naomi Chappelle started the Brooklyn Mitchell-Lama Task Force with other fellow Mitchell-Lama residents in 2003 in order to give a greater voice to Brooklyn residents in the Borough President's Office. She says it is important to educate the Mitchell-Lama residents because "there are a lot of problems in the coops. If we are united and informed we can work things out a little bit better."

